Supplementary Materials

Scenario Texts

Study 1a

Less likely

A runaway trolley is coming down the track. It is headed towards five people who cannot get out of its way. Sam, a passerby, realizes that he has the following two options. If he throws a switch, the trolley will be diverted, saving the five, but sending it down a side track where it will hit and kill a large man. If he does nothing, the trolley will hit the five and they will die, but the large man will live.

More Likely

A runaway trolley is coming down the track. It is headed towards five people who cannot get out of its way. Thomas, a passerby, realizes that he has the following two options. If he pushes a nearby large man onto the tracks, the man's bulk will stop the trolley before it hits the five, saving them but killing the large man. If he does nothing, the trolley will hit the five and they will die, but the large man will live.

Study1b

Set 1:

Less likely

A runaway trolley is coming down the track. It is headed towards five people who cannot get out of its way. Jessica, a passerby, realizes that she has the following two options. If she throws a switch, the trolley will be diverted to a side track where an individual is tied with his foot to the track, severing that man's foot and causing him to bleed to death, but saving the five. If she does nothing, the trolley will hit the five and they will die, but the individual will live.

More likely

A runaway trolley is coming down the track. It is headed towards five people who cannot get out of its way. Rachel, a passerby, realizes that she has the following two options. If she throws a switch, the trolley will be diverted to a side track where an individual is tied with his neck to the track, severing that man's neck and causing him to bleed to death, but saving the five. If she does nothing, the trolley will hit the five and they will die, but the individual will live.

Set 2:

Less likely

Charlie is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers has fallen and is now dangling by a damaged rope that will break in one minute. Charlie could use his rope to secure the party. To reach them in time, however, he needs to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge. Charlie realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge he will knock the man off the ledge, the man will fall to a flat rock surface about 10 feet below and will die as a result of injuries sustained by the fall, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will die.

More likely

Ben is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers has fallen and is now dangling by a damaged rope that will break in one minute. Ben could use his rope to secure the party. To reach them in time, however, he needs to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge. Ben realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge he will knock the man off the ledge, the man will fall to a flat rock surface about 150 feet below and will die as a result of injuries sustained by the fall, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will die.

Set 3:

Less likely

Steven is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers has fallen and is now dangling by a damaged rope that will break in one minute. Steven could use his rope to secure the party. To reach them in time, however, he needs to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. The ledge is not flat and it is covered with small, loose rocks, some of which will fall off the ledge and hit a climber below. Steven realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge, then he will knock some of the small rocks loose and they will strike the man below, killing that man, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man below will live, but the party of five will die.

More Likely

Jason is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers has fallen and is now dangling by a damaged rope that will break in one minute. Jason could use his rope to secure the party. To reach them in time, however, he needs to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. The ledge is not flat and there is a massive, unstable boulder blocking the path, which will come loose and fall on a climber below. Jason realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge, he will knock the boulder loose, and it will strike the man below, killing that man, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man below will live, but the party of five will die.

Study 3

Set 1:

Less likely:

A runaway trolley is rushing down the track. It is headed towards five people who cannot get out of its way. Jessica, a passerby, can only stop the trolley by pulling a lever that releases a bicycle onto the tracks from a bridge above. Unfortunately, pulling the lever will also send a fatal electric current through a cable that a worker is currently touching. Jessica realizes that she has the following two options. If she pulls the lever to release the bicycle, the worker will die, but the five will be saved. If she does nothing, the worker will survive, but the five will die.

More likely:

A runaway trolley is rushing down the track. It is headed towards five people who cannot get out of its way. Rachel, a passerby, can only stop the trolley by pulling a lever that releases a 100-ton granite block onto the tracks from a bridge above. Unfortunately, pulling the lever will also send a fatal electric current through a cable that a worker is currently touching. Rachel realizes that she has the following two options. If she pulls the lever to release the 100-ton granite block, the worker will die, but the five will be saved. If she does nothing, the worker will survive, but the five will die.

Set 2:

Less likely

Charlie is trout fishing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers is crossing the river using a nearby rope bridge that is beginning to collapse. Charlie could use his fishing line to secure the party. The only way to reach them in time, however, is to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge; rapidly traversing the ledge would require shoving the man into an unstable cliffside, causing a large boulder to dislodge and crush the man. Charlie realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge to secure the five with his fishing line, the man will be crushed by the boulder and die, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will plummet several hundred feet onto the jagged rocks sticking out of the river and die.

More likely:

Ben is climbing by himself in the mountains next to a river. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers is crossing the river using a nearby rope bridge that is beginning to collapse. Ben could use his climbing rope to secure the party. The only way to reach them in time, however, is to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge; rapidly traversing the ledge would require shoving the man into an

unstable cliffside, causing a large boulder to dislodge and crush the man. Ben realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge to secure the five with his climbing rope, the man will be crushed by the boulder and die, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will plummet several hundred feet onto the jagged rocks sticking out of the river and die.

Set 3:

Less likely

Steven is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A bear has cornered a party of five climbers against a cliffside, and is about to attack them. Steven could keep the bear from attacking by throwing pebbles at the bear. The only way to get close enough to do so, however, is to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge; traversing the ledge requires knocking the man off the ledge to the ground several hundred feet below. Steven realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge to throw pebbles at the bear, the man will die from the fall, but the five will be saved. If Steven does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will be mauled by the bear and die.

More Likely

Jason is a scientist studying bears by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A bear has cornered a party of five climbers against a cliffside, and is about to attack them. Jason could keep the bear from attacking by shooting it with his tranquilizer gun. The only way to get close enough to do so, however, is to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge; rapidly traversing the ledge requires knocking the man off the ledge to the ground several hundred feet below. Jason realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge to tranquilize the bear, the man will die from the fall, but the five will be saved. If Jason does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will be mauled by the bear and die

Study 5 Additional Scenarios

Set 2

Less likely

Corry is a miner. An explosion has just occurred in the mineshaft where he works, causing a partial collapse of a tunnel and trapping five of his colleagues behind a wall of rubble. A sixth colleague is on the side with Corry, but his foot is trapped in the rubble and he is trying to extricate himself. A small opening in the rubble allows the men on both sides to communicate with each other. The cavern where the five men are trapped is about to collapse. The only way to save the five in time is to blast a hole in the rubble with dynamite to create an opening for the men to escape. The men in the cavern would retreat far enough away to avoid being harmed by the blast. Unfortunately, the blast would kill the one whose foot is trapped. Corry realizes that he has the following two options. If he sets off a blast to create a hole in the rubble, the one whose foot is stuck will die from the blast, but the five will be saved. If he does not set off a blast, the one will live, but the five will die in the collapse of the cavern.

More likely

Travis is a miner. An explosion has just occurred in the mineshaft where he works, causing a partial collapse of a tunnel and trapping five of his colleagues behind a wall of rubble. A sixth colleague is on the side with Travis, but he is deeply stuck in the rubble and very severely injured. A small opening in the rubble allows the men on both sides to communicate with each other. Another explosion is likely to occur at any moment inside the cavern where the five men are trapped. The only way to save the five in time is to blast a hole in the rubble with dynamite to create an opening for the men to escape. The men in the cavern would retreat far enough away to avoid being harmed by the blast. Unfortunately, the blast would kill the one who is stuck and very severely injured. Travis realizes that he has the following two options. If he sets off a blast to create a hole in the rubble, the one who is deeply stuck in rubble and very severely injured will die from the blast, but the five will be saved. If he does not set off a blast, the one will live, but the five will die in the collapse of the cavern.

Set 4

Less Likely

Charlie is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers is crossing a nearby rope bridge that is beginning to collapse. Charlie could use his rope to secure the

party. The only way to reach them in time, however, is to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge; rapidly traversing the ledge would require shoving the man into an unstable cliffside, causing a large boulder to dislodge and crush the man. Charlie realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge the man will be crushed by the boulder and die, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will fall 10 feet to a flat rock surface below and die.

More likely

Ben is climbing by himself in the mountains. Suddenly, he hears cries for help coming from nearby. A party of five climbers is crossing a nearby rope bridge that is beginning to collapse. Ben could use his rope to secure the party. The only way to reach them in time, however, is to rapidly traverse a narrow ledge. Unfortunately, there is a man on the ledge; rapidly traversing the ledge would require shoving the man into an unstable cliffside, causing a large boulder to dislodge and crush the man. Ben realizes that he has the following two options. If he rapidly traverses the ledge the man will be crushed by the boulder and die, but the five will be saved. If he does not rapidly traverse the ledge, the man will live, but the party of five will plummet 1000 feet onto jagged rocks and die.